

CITY COUNCIL MEETING
JUNE 4, 1986

7

REFUSE COLLECTION
SYSTEM STUDY
APPROVED

CC-6
CC-22(b)
CC-54

Council, on motion of Council Member Pinkerton, Reid second, authorized the retention of the firm of Eljumaily-Butler Associates to conduct an in-depth evaluation of the City of Lodi's existing refuse collection system at a cost not to exceed \$16,500 which amount is to be funded from the Contingent Fund.

COUNCIL COMMUNICATION

TO: THE CITY COUNCIL
FROM: THE CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE

DATE

June 4, 1986

NO.

SUBJECT: REFUSE COLLECTION SYSTEM STUDY

PREPARED BY: City Manager

RECOMMENDED ACTION: That the City Council authorize the retention of the firm of Eljumaily-Butler Associates to conduct an in-depth evaluation of the City of Lodi's existing refuse collection system at a cost not to exceed \$16,500.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION: The Board of Supervisors of the County of San Joaquin recently took action extending the imposition of a gate fee of \$2 per cubic yard on all refuse taken to the Harney Lane Sanitary Landfill, except refuse collected in the City of Lodi. The City has an existing agreement with the County that provides for the payment to the County of a franchise fee of 7%. This fee has never been paid to the County for industrial refuse taken to Harney Lane site. The initial County position was that the gate fee should be applied to Lodi's industrial community effective last March. The City Council at its regular meeting of February 19, 1986 directed the staff to request a 60-day delay of the effective date of the industrial gate fee. This request was made to give the City some time to consider franchise modifications which might be appropriate. The County granted this request. The clock has run out on the 60-day periods, and the County has advised the City's franchise refuse hauler, Sanitary City Disposal Co. that the gate fee will be charged on all industrial refuse collected in the City effective June 1, 1986. Sanitary City Disposal has been so advised.

At the time the 60-day extension was discussed, staff advised the City Council that during this period staff would give consideration to recommending to the Council that a consulting firm, experienced in this particular field, be retained to conduct an evaluation of the existing refuse collection system. We have discussed such an evaluation in detail with Mr. Dave Vaccarezza of Sanitary City Disposal Co. and he is in agreement that such an evaluation would be beneficial to all concerned. Assistant City Manager Jerry Glenn and I interviewed representatives of two firms in this field, and the result of those interviews is the recommendation presented above. Reference checks of the firm of Eljumaily (pronounced el-ju-may-lee) -Butler proved very positive. The firm is highly respected by public works people, city managers, and the refuse collection as well. Mr. Vaccarezza is familiar with the capabilities of the person who would be the study director, Mr. Duane Butler, and he has informed me he would have no problem working with Mr. Butler. This is important. It is key to the effectiveness of the evaluation itself and the implementation of whatever recommendations are forthcoming, that the principals -- the City and the franchise hauler -- are in agreement regarding the study at the outset. If approved, the cost of the study would be a Contingent Fund expenditure.

Attached for the City Council's information and review is a copy of the proposal submitted by Eljumally-Butler Associates (Exhibit A). The key pages are pages 5 - 8 which discuss the scope of work. This section of the proposal is the result of a lengthy interview with Mr. Butler conducted by Mr. Glenn and me and I believe accurately summarizes the direction he was given. It is imperative to the success of any such study that the consultant has a clear understanding of what it is the client (in this case the City) wishes to explore and what kind of results the client expects to receive. I feel confident we have achieved that and can undertake this effort reasonably confident that the final product will be well worth the expenditure, and that the ultimate benefactors will be the rate payers.

The staff will be prepared to present this matter at Wednesday night's meeting and answer any questions Councilmembers may have.

Respectfully submitted,



Thomas A. Peterson
City Manager

TAP:jj

**SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT
RATE STUDY
CITY OF LODI**

SUBMITTED TO

OFFICE OF THE CITY MANAGER

APRIL 1986

JBBA

**ELJUMAILY-BUTLER ASSOCIATES
WASTE MANAGEMENT CONSULTANTS
SANTA ROSA, SACRAMENTO & AUBURN, CA
LAS VEGAS, NV**

**THE REPRODUCTION
OF THIS DOCUMENT
CANNOT BE IMPROVED
DUE TO THE CONDITION
OF THIS ORIGINAL**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
EBA BACKGROUND AND EXPERIENCE	1
SCHEDULE AND SCOPE OF WORK	3
COST ESTIMATE	8
STAFF TO BE ASSIGNED	10
REFERENCES	13

**EBA BACKGROUND
AND EXPERIENCE**

THE REPRODUCTION
OF THIS DOCUMENT
CANNOT BE IMPROVED
DUE TO THE CONDITION
OF THIS ORIGINAL

BACKGROUND AND ORGANIZATION OF ELJUMAILY-BUTLER ASSOCIATES (EBA)

ELJUMAILY-BUTLER ASSOCIATES (EBA) with offices in California and Nevada, provides specialized capabilities in the design and management of solid waste management. Principals in the partnership are Mundhir Eljumaily, P.E., Duane Butler, P.E., and Al Marino, R.S.

Mr. Butler will be the principal involved in this study. He has been in the solid waste management and engineering field for over 20 years. He is recognized as an expert manager in this field by the World Bank and the World Health Organization, and is a member of the North Coast Regional Water Quality Control Board. He has considerable experience in the preparation of comparative analyses and conceptual studies for public agencies, and in public works budget preparation and cost estimates.

A key senior engineer will assist Mr. Butler on this project. He is Mr. John Conaway, a former county public works director with public budgeting and finance experience, with direct experience in solid waste management duties.

The company is proud of its consistent high quality work and its ability to meet schedules. A large part of our workload is repeat and referral business. This good record is maintained by close liaison with our clients in setting clear and realistic project objectives and schedules.

The arrangement of waste management, contract administration, planning, and environmental engineering services in one coordinated office serves to insure complete attention to the details of planning and design which are consistent with proper evaluation, operation, and maintenance of a finished project.

The public administration experience within the firm insures proper liaison with public agencies, and helps to guarantee that details viewed as important from an agency standpoint are not overlooked in the project preparation and submittal.

The people assigned to this project are available, and can dedicate the necessary time and attention to the tasks.

A more complete Statement of Qualifications accompanies this Proposal

**SCHEDULE AND
SCOPE OF WORK**

**THE REPRODUCTION
OF THIS DOCUMENT
CANNOT BE IMPROVED
DUE TO THE CONDITION
OF THIS ORIGINAL**

SCHEDULE AND SCOPE OF WORK

- WEEKS -

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Award Contract and Finalize Scope of Work	●								
Assemble and Review Available Basic Information		—							
Existing Refuse Collection System			—						
Allocate Expenses				—					
Preliminary Analysis & Develop Alternative Rate Schedules					—				
Recommendations, Franchise Agreement							—		
Meet with City							●		
Prepare Draft Report								—	
Review of Draft Report by City									As Determined by City
Prepare, Print Final Report									2 - 3 weeks after completion of review period
Presentations									Two formal presentations

SCOPE OF WORK

Assemble and Review Available Basic Information

Review applicable City Codes, Ordinances and the Franchise Agreement. Review current rates for service. Assemble data concerning numbers and type of customers, number and size of bins and where utilized. Review maps of collection routes, and any pertinent City general planning data. Review cost data and collection system expenses.

This will involve coordination with City staff, since some of this information may be available in the City, and will also require the cooperation of the Franchise Hauler.

Evaluate the Existing Refuse Collection System

Development of refuse collection fees will require knowledge of the routing and collection system used by the contractor (residential, commercial, industrial), the quantity collected, and the equipment, manpower and other resources devoted to the activity. The relative efficiencies associated with multi-can collection stops vs. single-can stops, and the impact of single-family vs. multi-family collection points must be evaluated. Similarly, if there are variances to the types of commercial or industrial services which are provided, such as different sized containers, it must be considered.

This implies consideration of any mid-range or long-range plans developed by the Franchise Hauler relative to equipment planned to be acquired. This effects the prospective rates as a function of franchise life, and is a portion of the evaluation of any time extensions or types of renewals of the Franchise Agreement.

The purpose will be to conclude whether the refuse collection system is consistent with community needs and whether the need for institution of any system efficiencies is apparent. This will include evaluation of the current franchise refuse collection system, as well as collection of industrial waste and infectious wastes. Also comment and recommend on consistency of charges to various classes of consumers. This will require the cooperation of the Franchise Hauler.

Allocate Expenses

Allocate expenses associated with residential, commercial and industrial refuse collection. Evaluate effect upon collection rates of the ownership of vehicles, bins and the transfer station. This includes the evaluation of the impact of including industrial waste in the Franchise, and requires an understanding of the relationship between the Franchise Hauler and the owner of the industrial waste storage containers and collection vehicles (California Waste). Requires evaluation of the lease arrangements for the equipment, or parallel acquisition costs, and effect upon the rate structure.

Alternative Rate Schedules

Develop alternative rate schedules for review by the City, per can, per cubic yard, etc., based upon the cost of collection, transportation and disposal for residential (single and multi-family), commercial and industrial users. Establish a framework for an annual review process. The intent is to provide rate equity among users based upon their proportional demand on the service.

There is sometimes a tendency for rates for commercial and industrial service to subsidize the rates for residential collection. This is a local decision that should be discussed with City staff if the analysis tends to indicate that an otherwise unseemly increase to residential rate might be in order.

Recommendations on Franchise Agreement

Recommend changes in the Franchise Agreement as necessary to implement inclusion of industrial wastes, to allow time extensions, to include new fee structure, or to include any desired update.

Meetings, Coordination

Informal meetings or contact with City staff and Franchise Hauler as necessary during the conduct of the work, and two scheduled presentations, if requested by the City.

It is anticipated that one presentation might be at a workshop session, and that one presentation might be at a public meeting of the City Council.

It is expected that considerable interaction between the consultant, the franchised collector, and the City staff will be required during the course of the work. The consultant will endeavor to secure contractor's information and cooperation, and will use the necessary discretion to protect City's interests.

Draft Report

Prepare a comprehensive draft report setting forth the findings and recommendations. Submit three (3) copies of the draft report to the City for review and comment.

Final Report

Prepare a final report incorporating the review comments, and submit ten (10) copies of the final report to the City.

The results of both the draft and final report will be presented to City staff and other interested parties as requested by the City, subject to a limit of two presentations on the part of the consultant. Subject to City concurrence, it is anticipated that one presentation might be at a workshop session, and that one presentation might be at a public meeting before the City Council.

COST ESTIMATE

**THE REPRODUCTION
OF THIS DOCUMENT
CANNOT BE IMPROVED
DUE TO THE CONDITION
OF THIS ORIGINAL**

COST ESTIMATE

The time to be expended depends somewhat on the availability of records from the Franchise Hauler. The City has already indicated the availability of all pertinent information in its files. We believe that we can create a climate of cooperation which will be beneficial to the project, and that the Franchise Hauler will cooperate.

An estimate of \$16,500 is based upon timely receipt of requested information and efficient scheduling of meetings with interested parties. The estimate includes all professional and clerical services, travel, reproduction and miscellaneous costs. Any services agreement between EBA and the City of Lodi should stipulate the above amount as a maximum not to be exceeded without prior written approval by the City.

STAFF TO BE ASSIGNED

STAFF

An important element in providing the required solid waste rate study for Lodi is the selection of team members with the right balance of operational and management experience, and who understand and have worked with public budgets and fees. As discussed with you, Duane Butler, P.E., and John Conaway, P.E., have the necessary background and will be the persons working on your project.

PRINCIPAL
DUANE BUTLER, P.E.

Registrations and Affiliations:

Registered Professional Engineer, California, Nevada and Maryland
Governmental Refuse Collection and Disposal Association
International Solid Wastes and Public Cleansing Association
American Society of Civil Engineers
California Refuse Removal Council
U.S. Public Health Service, Reserve

Educational Background:

University of California, Berkeley
B.S., Civil Engineering

Summary:

Prior to establishing his own firm, Mr. Butler's professional experience included having served as a governmental Public Works Official, as a Planning Director, Director of Community and Environmental Services, and as a staff engineer with the Pan American Health Organization. He has been directly involved in waste management activities for over 20 years, and has direct experience in landfill operation, and solid waste master planning and budgeting.

He has consulted internationally for the World Bank, the Pan American Health Organization, and private firms advising on environmental engineering, refuse collection, landfill disposal, master planning, and in organization and budgeting. He has acted as an instructor in landfill technology for the California Waste Management Board, and was a guest speaker at a World Bank staff training seminar concerned with landfill design and management.

Mr. Butler has been appointed by the Governor to the California Regional Water Quality Control Board, and is a member of several professional and technical societies.

SENIOR ENGINEER
JOHN CONAWAY, P.E.

Registrations and Affiliations:

Registered Professional Engineer, California, Nevada and South
Carolina
Governmental Refuse and Disposal Association
American Society of Civil Engineers
California Refuse Removal Council

Education:

Utah State University
B.S., Civil Engineering

Summary:

Mr. Conaway has served as a Director of Public Works in Sierra County, CA and Gaston County, S.C., and has served as waste management director for governmental agencies. He is experienced in management of waste collection and disposal systems. He has also designed and operated sanitary landfills and transfer stations and is familiar with modern collection and disposal equipment and techniques, and has hands-on experience in leachate control systems and groundwater monitoring. Mr. Conaway has over 15 years of solid waste management background.

He served as a special consultant to the California Waste Management Board concerning sanitary landfill operation and equipment selection, and has been a guest speaker to the Governmental Refuse Collection and Disposal Association.

REFERENCES

REFERENCES

Mr. Tom Walters
Empire Waste Management
P.O. Box 697
Santa Rosa, CA
707/585-0291

Mr. Herb Iwahiro
Assistant Executive Officer
State Waste Management Board
1020 9th Street
Sacramento, CA
916/322-3330

Mr. Ken Blackman
City Manager
City of Santa Rosa
City Hall
Santa Rosa, CA
707/576-5361

Mr. Sam Roybal
Vice-President
Envirocal/Sunset Scavenger
Beatty Ave. & Tunnel Road
San Francisco, CA
415/467-2300

Mr. C. F. Campbell
Director of Public Works
County of Mendocino
Courthouse
Ukiah, CA
707/463-4363

Mr. Dick Curry
Director of Public Works
County of Shasta
1855 Placer Street
Redding, CA 96001
916/225-5661

Mr. Donald Head
Director of Public Works
County of Sonoma
575 Administration Dr. Room 117A
Santa Rosa, CA 95401
707/527-2231